CHROM. 4225

## THE IDENTIFICATION OF SESQUITERPENE HYDROCARBONS FROM GAS-LIQUID CHROMATOGRAPHY RETENTION DATA

NIELS H. ANDERSEN AND MARK S. FALCONE\* Department of Chemistry, University of Washington, Seattle, Wash. 98105 (U.S.A.) (Received June 9th, 1969)

#### SUMMARY

The identification of sesquiterpenes by gas-liquid chromatography is evaluated. Retention indices (obtained using sesquiterpene standards rather than *n*-alkanes) were found to be the most reproducible form of GLC data. Retention data for fiftyfive sesquiterpenes and a number of saturated hydrocarbons obtained by hydrogenation of sesquiterpenes are reported.

### INTRODUCTION

Until recently the study of the sesquiterpenes from natural sources has been plagued by separation problems since most plants produce complicated mixtures of very similar compounds. With the increased use of GLC<sup>1-3</sup> and adsorption chromatography on selective phases (such as  $AgNO_3$ -silica)<sup>3-6</sup> many sesquiterpenes of unquestioned purity have been isolated. However, these unsaturated compounds generally are quite unstable and thus it is virtually impossible to keep large numbers of authentic samples for GLC comparison.

Among the goals of our research are biogenetic studies using radiolabeled sesquiterpene precursors in whole plants and plant extracts. In connection with these studies we required analytical techniques which would allow us to identify the components of gross mixtures available in only small amounts (10  $\mu$ g-10 mg). We felt that GLC on a number of different columns (with appropriate standardization procedures) should serve to identify the major sesquiterpene hydrocarbons in such mixtures.

At present, the less numerous, and more thoroughly studied, monoterpene hydrocarbons can be identified unambiguously by GLC on one or two columns (e.g. ref. 7). The retention data from such studies have generally been given in KOVATS' indices or as retention times relative to a standard terpene. We felt that the more numerous sesquiterpenes\*\* could be identified in a similar manner if retention data were obtained on a sufficient number of distinct selective phases.

<sup>\*</sup>Undergraduate research participant, University of Washington, 1968–1969. \*\* At present at least a hundred distinct sesquiterpene hydrocarbons have been charac-terized. However, this probably accounts for only one third of the possible structures. Thus the retention data for a component of a mixture must also be precise (and dependable) enough to indicate that a new substance has been isolated.

### METHODS AND MATERIALS

#### Materials

The sesquiterpenes were either obtained through the generosity of other workers in the field or by isolation from the appropriate essential oils. The identity and purity of these samples were verified through IR and NMR spectroscopy.

H. U. DAENIKER (Givaudan Corp.) supplied  $\alpha$ -cedrene,  $\beta$ -cedrene, valencene, and thujopsene. G. OURISSON (Institut de Chimie, Strasbourg, France) supplied longifolene, cyperene, caryophyllene,  $\alpha$ -gurjunene, and calarene. V. HEROUT (Institute of Organic Chemistry and Biochemistry, Czech. Acad. of Science) supplied  $\beta(\gamma)$ -bisabolene, cyperene,  $\gamma$ -muurolene,  $\varepsilon$ -muurolene,  $\gamma$ -cadinene,  $\beta$ -bourbonene, humulene, the santalenes, and  $\gamma$ -amorphene. S. DEV (National Chemical Laboratory, Poona-8, India) supplied  $\alpha$ -himachalene,  $\beta$ -himachalene,  $\alpha$ -copaene, and  $\beta$ -selinene. L. WESTFELT (Swedish Forest Products Research Laboratory, 114 86 Stockholm, Sweden) supplied longicyclene,  $\alpha$ -muurolene, and  $\gamma$ -muurolene. J. E. McMURRY (Univ. of California, Santa Cruz) supplied cyclosativene, sativene, and isosativene. Y. HIROSE AND Y. OHTA (The Institute of Food Chemistry, Osaka, Japan) supplied  $\alpha$ -ylangene,  $\delta$ -cadinene,  $\alpha$ -amorphene, and  $\alpha$ -muurolene.

 $\delta$ -Selinene was obtained from  $\beta$ -selinene by treatment with formic acid.  $\alpha$ -Curcumene was isolated from the oil of *Curcuma aromatica*.  $\alpha$ -Copaene,  $\alpha$ -curcumene, longifolene,  $\beta$ -farnesene,  $\beta$ -curcumene,  $\gamma$ -curcumene,  $\gamma$ -cadinene, and  $\delta$ -cadinene were isolated from the needle oil of *Chamaecyparis nootkatensis*<sup>8</sup>.  $\beta$ -Selinene and  $\alpha$ -selinene were isolated from oil of celery.  $\alpha$ -Zingaberene was isolated from oil of ginger.  $\alpha$ -Muurolene and  $\delta$ -cadinene were isolated from rectified cade oil. Humulene and caryophyllene were isolated from wild ginger oil. Zizaene, cyclocopacamphene,  $\beta$ vetivenene,  $4\beta$ H-nootkata-1(10),7(11),8-triene, and the antipodes of  $5\alpha$ H-selina-4(14),7-diene, and  $5\alpha$ H-selina-4(14),7(11)-diene were isolated from oil of vetiver and this work will be the subject of another communication.

### Methods

The analyses were performed on a F & M Scientific Series 700 labo atory chromatograph (Hewlett-Packard) equipped with WX filaments. The columns used were 16-50 ft.  $\times$  0.125 in. The stationary phase loading was 0.5-3% on silanized Chromosorb G. The columns had between 300-800 theoretical plates per foot under normal operating conditions (80-200°, 15-40 cc/min flow of helium).

The sesquiterpenes and *n*-alkane standards were introduced as 2-10% solutions in *n*-decane. The injection volumes were  $0.1-0.6\mu$ l, delivered with a  $1\mu$ l Hamilton syringe. KovATS' indices were calculated using *n* (even) *n*-alkanes or by the method given below. The odd *n*-alkanes generally lie on a different line than the even ones on a plot of *n* vs. log  $t_R'$ . KovATS' indices<sup>9</sup> were calculated only when the peaks for the unknown and co-injected standards corresponded to those obtained from 0.02- $0.2\mu$ l of a 5% solution of the pure substances. Careful studies indicated that overloading effects (skewing to longer retention time, peak broadening, etc.) could not be detected until the injection volume was  $0.9\mu$ l of a 5% solution. Thus all measurements were obtained from traces on which all of the important peaks were Gaussian and far below maximum loading.

The method of calculating KOVATS' indices (using two sesquiterpenes as



Fig. 1. Schematic GLC trace.

54

standards, A and B) and relative retentions is shown below, together with an illustrative trace (Fig. 1):

$$RR_{\mathbf{X}} (\text{rel. to A}) = \frac{t'_{R} (\mathbf{X})}{t'_{R} (\text{std A})}$$
$$I_{\mathbf{X}} = I_{\text{std A}} + \left(\frac{\log t'_{R} (\mathbf{X}) - \log t'_{R} (\text{std A})}{\log t'_{R} (\text{std B}) - \log t'_{R} (\text{std A})}\right) (I_{\text{std B}} - I_{\text{std A}})$$

### RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The first problem was to determine the most reproducible form of retention data. Preliminary studies indicated that relative retention times (from RR = 0.4-2.0) could be reproduced ( $\pm 0.8\%$ ) on a single column as long as the temperature was kept with a 5° range and the flow rates were controlled to  $\pm 10\%$ . However, relative retentions could not be reproduced as well on other columns containing the same stationary phase. KovATS' indices were more reproducible from column to column but varied significantly with temperature (see Table I). We found that  $\Delta I/\Delta T \sim \pm 1.1$  for sesquiterpenes on Carbowax, and that  $\Delta I/\Delta T$  increased on polar columns and was somewhat less on less selective non-polar phases. In all cases, the KovATS'

TABLE I

Compound	I	Δt			
	132°	205°			
Longicyclene	1518.8	1598.5	80		
a-Copaene	1521.5	1593	71.5		
a-Cedrene	1597.5	1689	91.5		
Longifolene	1600.0	1697	97		
Caryophyllene	1618.5	1695.5	77		
Humulene	1681.5	1765	83.5		
Valencene	1725.5	1801	75.5		
a-Muurolene	1726	1792	66		
γ-Cadinene	1762	1835.5	73.5		

Kovats' indices of selected sesquiterpenes on Carbowax 20 M

J. Chromatog., 44 (1969) 52-59

indices increased with increasing temperature. Under normal laboratory conditions the oven temperature can be reproduced to  $\pm$  3° and thus KOVATS' indices could be reproduced to only  $\pm$  3.5 units (out of 1400–1900 units) with all other sources of error discounted.

The temperature dependence variation in KOVATS' indices<sup>1</sup> within the sesquiterpenes is much less  $(\Delta I/\Delta T = + 1.1 \pm 0.25)$  for the entire group) and thus KOVATS' indices can be reproduced to  $\pm 1$  unit by using sesquiterpenes as standards rather than using even n-alkanes as is usually done. Our usual procedure consisted of determining (in the usual manner<sup>9</sup>) the KOVATS' indices of a number of sesquiterpenes on a single phase on one day so as to minimize temperature variation. From then on, the indices of additional sesquiterpenes were determined using sesquiterpenes as standards (see *Methods*). We generally used  $\alpha$ -copaene- $\alpha$ -cedrene-humulene- $\gamma$ -cadinene mixtures for standardization. The indices for sesquiterpenes on seven different stationary phases are collected in Table II. In addition, approximate indices can be calculated for other sesquiterpenes from GLC traces in the literature if the traces also show: (1) the air peak and peaks due to two sesquiterpenes for which standardized indices are available; or (2) peaks due to three sesquiterpenes for which standardized indices are known. Approximate KOVATS' indices obtained in this way are included in Table II, and are indicated by an asterisk. Chromatographic data from refs. 1-3 were used for these calculations. A trace of the hydrocarbon portion of the oil of Mentha piperita on Apiezon L<sup>3</sup> was particularly informative. The trace included peaks for ylangene, humulene, and y-cadinene which were used for standardization. The indices calculated for  $\beta$ -bourbonene, caryophyllene,  $\gamma$ -muurolene,  $\alpha$ muurolene, and  $\delta$ -cadinene (also appearing in this oil) were within  $\pm$  3 units (average) of the values obtained by us.

Examination of the data presented in Table II quickly shows that all of these sesquiterpenes can be distinguished by the use of only two to three different phases. Thus other workers should be able to confirm the identity of these substances by co-injection with two identified sesquiterpenes appearing in Table II. The types of selectivity displayed by various stationary phases will be discussed in detail in a later communication. However, some correlations deserve comment at this point. In every case except the himachalenes the *exo*-methylene isomers are eluted after the corresponding trisubstituted olefins. Comparison of the indices for  $\alpha$ -curcumene and  $\beta$ -curcumene (or  $\delta$ -cadinene) reveals an increasing affinity (and therefore retention) for atomatics in going from Apiezon L to Carbowax and particularly DEGS. There are many other cases of position reversals not only on changing stationary phase but even with temperature changes on a single phase (see longicyclene- $\alpha$ -copaene, longifolene-caryophyllene-calarene, thujopsene-santalene, valencene- $\beta$ -bisabolene- $\alpha$ -muurolene all on Carbowax 20M).

In the structure elucidation of sesquiterpenes it is a common practice to identify the carbon skeleton of a new sesquiterpene by hydrogenation to the fully saturated ring system. The saturated hydrocarbons are usually identified from their physical properties and by comparison of thick-film IR spectra with the published standards<sup>11</sup>. However, this method is not foolproof. The IR spectra of saturated hydrocarbons are particularly devoid of useful detail for such comparisons and these substances have very low rotatory powers. In addition, the hydrogenations involved usually introduce new asymmetric centers and the resulting products are mixtures of dia-

J. Chromatog., 44 (1969) 52-59

The	DIFIED KOVATS' INDICES OF e values for the sesquiterper entheses have been obtained	<ul> <li>SESQUITERPENI</li> <li>nes indicated by</li> <li>d from a single</li> </ul>	ss an asterisk trace only.	are approxima	tte only, sinc	e they are ol	otained from	ı traces in t	he literature	1-3. Values ii
		A piezon L	SF-96	SE-30	DC-710d	QF-1	Carbowas	t 20 M		DEGS
		CC1	1/0	130°	Cnt	134	I32°	ı65°	205°	-001
Η	Cubebene <sup>*</sup>	1368								
61	a-Longipinene*	<b>}</b>		1359.5						
ŝ	u-Ylangene	1401.5	1396.1		1454-5			1538.5		1653
4	$\beta$ -Elemene <sup>•</sup>	0141								
ŝ	a-Bourbonene <sup>*</sup>	1410								
9	a-Copaene	1410.2	1400-5	1378-5	1459	1447	1521.5	1551.3	1593	1665
2	Cyclosativene	6.1141	1399.7					1549		(1684) <sup>c</sup>
s	Longicyclene	1.711	1.0041	1371	1 <u>5</u> 1	1465	1518.8	1554	1598.5	1684
6	Cyclocopacamphene	1417.8				1467.2		I 555.4		1685.6
10	$\beta$ -Bourbonene	1,118.3	1411.7	1386	1477-3	1477-5	1547	1586.5	1618	t1/1
II	$\beta$ -Farnesene	1429.2				1 509		1668		1818.5
12	Sativene	1+3+.7	1,20.7					1594.5		(1738)°
13	Cyperene	1446.6	1432.5	1398	1021	1493	1562	1606	1650	1736.5
14	a-Gurjunene		1435.2	1413	1500.5	1471	1558	1951	1633	1712.5
15	Caryophyllene	1451.7	1445-3	5-7141	1523	(1587)	1618.5	1655-5	1695-5	1 <sup>8</sup> 35-5
16	Longifolene	0.404.0	1440.2	tot1	1317.5	1520	1600	1643	1691	1802.5
17	Isosativene	1-101-1	1440.9					1639		(1797) <sup>c</sup>
18	Calarene	1466.0	1459-7	1435	1535-5	1513	1618	1655.5	1700	1 So6
61	<b>β-Ylangene</b> <sup>*</sup>			~1417.5						
20	b-Copaene			<u>∼</u> 1422.5				,		
21	a-Cedrene	1473.4	0.5441	~1414	1310	1518	1597.5	1640	1689	1758.5
22	Thujopsene	1476.1	1458.3	1430.5	I542.3	1540	1643	1684.2	1732	1858.5
23	Aromadendrene	<u></u>								
5	a-Maaliene	~1477								
0 i	y-Curcumene	1401.9				1532.5	i J	,		-0-
20	p-Cedrene	1402.4	1454.0	1421	1533-5	1539-5	1024.5	0201	1714	1034.5
27	a-Curcumene	1483	1450.4	(1475)	1589	I557-5		1787.5	(ISI4)	1992.5
28	<i>E</i> -Muurolene	1484.8	(i474.0)	(1445) (1445)	(1561.5)	1552.5	(1675.5)	1713.8	(1759.5)	1893.5
29	Humulene	1487.2	1476.6	1446.5	1561.5	1583.5	1681	61/1	1765	1929.5
õ	Santalene(minor)		1459.5	1441	1535	1522	1644.5	1671	1702	1830
31	Santalene (major)		1470.5	1454	1548	1533.5	1058	1023	1714.5	1843.5
32	Selina-4(14), 7-diene <sup>a</sup>	6.1941	1475.7			1542		1691		1852.5
ŝ	0-Selinene <sup>a</sup>	1504.5						1728.5		
34	<i>y</i> -Muurolene	1505.7				1545		1725		0881
35	$\gamma$ -Amorphene	1500.4				1544-5		1724		1390.5

56

N. H. ANDERSEN, M. S. FALCONE

. .

J. Chromatog., 44 (1969) 52-59

**TABLE II** 

1370 1897 1879,5	1909.5 1922.5	8491	1958		1927.5 2026.0		1959	C	1978.5 (2018)¢	1010-1	2111	n <sup>10</sup> : ,8-triene.
<u>1755</u>	1772	(1762) 1801	1799 1815-5	1815	1792		1818	c	1835-5			ering show ng systems a-1(10),7(11
1704.5 1724.5 1706.3	1745.5 1756	1738 1760	1752.5 1766.5	1765.5	1752.5 1817		1784		1792.3 1816.2	COLOT	1885	n the numb nd numberi 3H-nootkat:
1002.Ĵ	1726	1725.5	1717		1726			,	1702			ure based o rojections a
1533-5 1535 1562	1548 1548 1547-5	1581	1578 1597-5		1558.5			c	1587 1611 E	CHIN		of nomenclat g structure p ne; a-pyrove
1561.5 1582.5	1592.5	15 <sup>8</sup> 3.5 ~1600	1607.5 1595	1091	<b>℃</b> 1600		1628.5		1623.5			LD's system ( +,6-diene]. 1 the following -1,7(11),9-trie
I444	1496.5	1457	16†1	•	1495		~1504ª*		1506.5			using THEOBA d-selinene [= imed based or µ $eta$ H-nootkata
1491.7 1481.8	1510.3	(1479.6) 1508.8	1506.3	(1505)	1507.7 1521.5	ר ר	(1526.4)	; ; ;	1523.5		1563.3	e designated r1-diene] and rpenes are na a a e e
1508.0 1509.5 1511.6	1512.9 1513.6	1525.6	1529.7 1530.2	1531.3	1531.3 1533.9	1534-5	1530 1546.4	~I550	1554.9	0.2/C1 1580	1583.0	rocarbons ar le $[= 4(14), 1$ tane sesquite 245 = 6 6 Nootkatan I-diene; $\beta$ -ve
					٩				rr) diana8	11)-uiciic" liene <sup>a</sup>		esmane) hyd mej, $\beta$ -selinen and nootkaf 3
Himachalene Amorphene zaene	Bisabolene Curcumene	Zingaberene alencene <sup>b</sup>	Himachalene Selinene <sup>a</sup>	Bisabolene	Muurolene Pvrovetivene	Selinene <sup>a</sup>	Durgarene Cadinene	ilamenene <sup>*</sup>	Cadinene	cuna-4(14), // /lina-3.7(11)-d	Vetivenene <sup>b</sup>	Selinane (eud $\begin{bmatrix} 5 \\ 9 \\ 6 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 12 \\ 6 \\ 13 \\ 6 \\ 13 \\ 6 \\ 13 \\ 12 \\ 6 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 \\ 13 $
36 a- 37 a- 28 Zi	د ور و و و و	41 a- 42 Vi	43 4 β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β-β	45 7-	46 a- 47 a-	84 84 9 9	50 50	21 21	52 [ 24		55 β-	$a = \frac{2}{14}$ $b = $

# IDENTIFICATION OF SESQUITERPENE HYDROCARBONS

(1827.9), selina-4(14),7-diene (1888.3), zizaene (1923.4),  $\beta$ -bisabolene (1935.0),  $\delta$ -cadinene (1990.4),  $\gamma$ -bisabolene (1997.6),  $\gamma$ -cadinene (2015.0), a-curcumene (2018.6), selina-4(14),7(11)-diene (2049), and a-pyrovetivene (2074.0).

<sup>d</sup> A  $_{15}^{\circ}$  increase leads to Kovars' indices from 7.5-15 units higher than those listed. ( $\Delta I/\Delta T$ )<sub>ave</sub> = 0.75.

J. Chromatog., 44 (1969) 52-59

57

### TABLE III

KOVATS' INDICES OF HYDROGENATION PRODUCTS OF SESQUITERPENES

Hydrogenations were performed using Adam's catalyst in all cases. The solvent was acetic acid unless otherwise specified.

Compounda	Hydrogenation	Retention index					
	pround of	A piezon L 155°	SF-96 170°	Carbowax 20 M 165°	DEGS 175°		
Farnesanc	$\beta$ -farnescne	1367.6		<b>1</b> 354	1350		
Bisabolane I	$\beta$ -bisabolene	1458.4		1501	1557		
Bisabolane II <sup>h</sup>	$\beta$ -curcumene <sup>b</sup>	1463.6		1520.7	1586.5		
Copaane I	<i>a</i> -copaene	1477.2	1455 <b>.</b> 4	1598.8	1740		
Copaane II <sup>e</sup>		1437.3	1420.6	1550	1676		
Muurolane I	<i>a</i> -muurolene	1479.2	1454-7	1582	1713		
Muurolane II		1535.6	1505.6	1659	1808.5		
Cadinane 1	γ-cadinene <sup>d</sup>	1503.2	1483.4	1618	1760		
Cadinane II		1493.5	1478.4	1597	1728		
Amorphane I	<i>a</i> -amorphene	1489.8	1463.4	1593	1718.2		
Amorphane II		1524.4	1498.4	1648.5	1794.2		
Calarane	calarene	1508.1	1489.3	1670.5	1845.5		
4,5 $\alpha$ H-Eudesmane = selinane	$\beta$ -selinene	1539.6	1509.5	1664.5	1819.4		
Nootkatane	valencene	1530.6	1500.9	1648	1796.2		
Vetivane I = nootkatane	e	1529.8	1500.4	1649	1797		
Vetivane II = 7-epinootkatane	D	1553	1518.7	1683	1843.5		
Cedrane I	$\beta$ -cedrene	1521.3	1479-4	1662	1841.5		
Cedrane II		1509.1	1470-3	~1651	~1826		
Zizaane	zizaene	1513.1	1479-4	1660	1842.5		

<sup>a</sup> When several diastereomeric products were obtained they are listed in order of decreasing proportion in the mixture obtained.

<sup>b</sup> The two bisabolanes are obtained in a 1:1 ratio from  $\beta$ -bisabolene. Hydrogenation of  $\beta$ -curcumene gives a 1:1.7 mixture of bisabolanes I and II respectively.

• Produced in higher yield when hydrogenation is performed with benzene as the solvent. •  $\delta$ -Cadinene yields cadinane II, cadinane I, and muurolane II as the major hydrogenation products.

• From either  $\beta$ -vetivenene or *a*-pyrovetivene.

stereomers—the exact composition varying with the placement of the double bonds in the original sesquiterpene. Here again, precise and reproducible GLC retention data could offer a more dependable basis for identification. To this end, we have hydrogenated some common sesquiterpenes and determined the KovATS' indices of the resulting hydrocarbons. The products obtained from the hydrogenation reactions were GLC resolvable mixtures of diastereomers in all cases for which inspection of Dreiding models suggested nonstereospecific hydrogenation. The compositions of these mixtures and the structure assignments for the components will be the subject of another communication. Table III gives the indices for the major saturated products obtained. KovATS' indices for the hydrogenation products showed temperature dependence similar to that of the sesquiterpenes themselves; for this reason the indices were calculated using sesquiterpene standards.

Preliminary examinations of monoterpenes and oxygenated sesquiterpenes indicate that highly reproducible retention indices can be obtained by the internal standardization method used above for the sesquiterpene hydrocarbons. Extensions of Tables II and III and tables of retention indices for other natural products will be published periodically in the Chromatographic Data section of this journal.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to thank professors G. OURISSON, V. HEROUT, S. DEV, L. WESTFELT, and Y. HIROSE for their generosity in supplying authentic sesquiterpenes and Givaudan Corporation and Fritzsche Brothers, Inc. for supplying oil samples.

Partial support of this research by a Frederick Gardner Cottrell Grant from the Research Corporation is acknowledged.

REFERENCES

- I R. D. HARTLEY AND C. H. FAWCETT, Phytochemistry, 8 (1969) 637.
- 2 L. WESTFELT, Acta Chem. Scand., 20 (1966) 2829.
- 3 R. VLAHOV, M. HOLUB, I. OGNJANOV AND V. HEROUT, Collection Czech. Chem. Commun., 32 (1967) 808.
- 4 S. WITEK AND J. KREPINSKY, Collection Czech. Chem. Commun., 31 (1966) 113.
- 5 A. S. GUPTA AND S. DEV, J. Chromatog., 12 (1963) 189.
- 6 N. P. DAMODARAN AND S. DEV, Tetrahedron, 24 (1968) 4113.
- 7 T. SAKAI, H. MAARSE, R. E. KEPNER, W. G. JENNINGS AND W. M. LONGHURST, J. Agr. Food Chem., 15 (1967) 1070.
- 8 N. H. ANDERSEN AND D. SYRDAL, unpublished work.
- 9 E. KOVATS, Helv. Chim. Acta, 41 (1958) 1915.
- 10 D. W. THEOBALD, Tetrahedron, 19 (1963) 2261.
- 11 J. PLIVA, M. HORAK, V. HEROUT AND F. SORM, Die Terpene, Sammlung der Spektren und physikalischen Konstanten, Vol. I, Sesquiterpene, Akademie Verlag, Berlin, 1960.

J. Chromatog., 44 (1969) 52-59